



SMITHFIELD CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MINUTES August 18, 2021

The Planning Commission of Smithfield City met in the City Council Chambers
96 South Main, Smithfield, Utah at 6:30 p.m. on Wednesday, August 18, 2021

The following members were present constituting a quorum:

Members Present: Scott Gibbons, Katie Bell, Brook Freidenberger, Jasilyn Heaps, Bob Holbrook, Stuart Reis, Juli Weber

Members Excused: Hutch Daniels

City Staff: Brian Boudrero, Clay Bodily, Jon Wells (City Councilmember), Mayor Barnes

Others in Attendance: Brian Higginbotham, Marshae Stokes, Sandra Atwood, Erin Campbell, Brittany Andrus, Dan Larsen, Debbie Zilles

6:30 p.m. Meeting called to order by Chairman Gibbons

Consideration of consent agenda and approval of meeting minutes

After consideration by the Commission, Chairman Gibbons declared the meeting agenda and the minutes from the July 21, 2021 meeting to stand as submitted.

RESIDENT INPUT - None

AGENDA ITEMS

Discussion and possible vote on the Conditional Use Permit request by Charles Bartlett to allow a temporary camp/travel trailer on a parcel located at 40 South 200 East.

Charles Bartlett lives on a 0.8-acre lot (08-070-0063) located at 40 South and 200 East. The lot is zoned R-1-10 and surrounded by R-1-10 zoning, except for a multi-family lot directly to the east.

Sandra Atwood, the daughter of Charles Bartlett explained that her son would like to temporarily live on the lot behind the home in a trailer to help with his grandparents. Charles Bartlett has had a stroke and his wife has dementia. They are planning on a 6-8 month stay and not requesting any utility connections.

Ms. Atwood confirmed for Commissioner Bell that the trailer will not be needed longer than 9 months. Commissioner Bell suggested adding a timeline condition to the approval. Ms. Atwood said she was fine with that suggestion, if for some reason they will need to be there longer, they will come in and request an extension. She also explained that the trailer is self-contained and will primarily be sleeping quarters. Her son will have access to the home so there should not be any septic needs. An extension cord will be used for power as needed.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Bell to approve the Conditional Use Permit request by Charles Bartlett to allow a temporary camp/travel trailer on a parcel located at 40 South 200 East for a maximum 9-month term. Commissioner Reis seconded the motion. Motion approved (7-0).

Vote:

Aye: Bell, Freidenberger, Gibbons, Heaps, Holbrook, Reis, Weber

Continued discussion and possible vote on Ordinance 21-27, an ordinance rezoning Cache County Parcel Numbers 08-118-0011 and 08-118-0014 from RM (Multiple Family Residential) to RM PUD (Multiple Family Residential Planned Unit Development Overlay Zone). The parcels are located at approximately 80 East 600 South. The parcels total approximately 3.80 acres.

Last month, Marshae Stokes with Heritage Land Development, presented a preliminary plan for a PUD rezone of lots 08-118-0011 and 08-118-0014 (Mountain Valley PUD). The Commission decided to table this item to give them time to review a few requested changes to the plan. She has returned with the requested changes made to the plans. They have shifted the entire west side of the development to be 30' from the property line. All the back-loaded driveways have been lengthened to 25' from the building face to the sidewalk, to eliminate overhanging vehicles in the right-of-way. The road width has been extended to a 60' right-of-way as requested. A 20' dedicated right-of-way has been placed over the sewer line that connects to the existing property to the south.

The two lots in question (08-118-0011 and 08-118-0014) are currently zoned multi-family and total 3.8 acres. They are surrounded by R-1-10 to the southwest, Community Commercial to the northwest and Multi-Family directly east, across 100 East Street. Neither of the two properties are encumbered with easements.

Mr. Bodily pointed out that the right-of-way is now 60'. Chairman Gibbons said he likes this better and believes it will help with parking on 100 East.

Mr. Bodily reminded the Commission that because this is a PUD, the approval will need to include a notation about increased density, non-traditional setbacks, and the fact that it will be a public road.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Heaps to forward a recommendation to the City Council to approve Ordinance 21-27, an ordinance rezoning Cache County Parcel Numbers 08-118-0011 and 08-118-0014 from RM (Multiple Family Residential) to RM PUD (Multiple Family Residential Planned Unit Development Overlay Zone). The parcels are located at approximately 80 East 600 South and total approximately 3.80 acres, acknowledging the non-traditional setbacks, and the the road will be public, not private. Commissioner Bell seconded the motion. Motion approved (7-0).

Vote:

Aye: Bell, Freidenberger, Gibbons, Heaps, Holbrook, Reis, Weber

Note: Because this was not advertised as an approval of the preliminary plat, that will need to be reviewed and approved at next month's meeting with the final plat; the approval for tonight is only for the request zone change.

Public Hearing, no sooner than 6:45 P.M., for the purpose of discussing Ordinance 21-25, an Ordinance rezoning Cache County Parcel Numbers 08-043-0022, 08-043-0021, 08-043-0025, 08-043-0031, 08-043-0013, 08-043-0012, 08-043-0010, 08-043-0011, 08-043-0007, 08-043-0006, 08-043-0002, 08-043-0003, 08-043-0016, 08-043-0013 and 08-043-0014 from A-10 (Agricultural 10-Acre) and R-1-10 (Single-Family Residential 10,000 Square Feet) to MPC (Master Planned Community). The parcels total approximately 89.79 acres. The parcels are located at approximately 100 West to 300 West from 450 North to 800 North.

6:49 p.m. Public Hearing Opened

6:50 p.m. Public Hearing Closed

Discussion and possible vote on Ordinance 21-25

At the last commission meeting, Dan Larsen presented the Golden Forest Development preliminary plan for an MPC rezone. The request was continued to this meeting because they had changed too much of the property line location on the plan. The applicant was asked to attend another STRC meeting with the changes made. Mr. Larsen attended the August 4, 2021, STRC meeting and presented the updated plan. He is still requesting a rezone to the MPC (Master Plan Community) for 15 properties located from 100 West to 300 West and 450 North to 800 North. The existing properties are currently zoned A-10 (Agricultural 10 acre) and R-1-10 and total 89.79 acres. A canal easement that runs the length of the east side of the site and a railroad easement that runs the entire length of the west side of the site.

Commissioner Freidenberger clarified that this is only a zone change. Chairman Gibbons confirmed that the preliminary plat and final plat will be reviewed and approved at the next meeting (just like the previous project). Tonight's approval will be for the zone change only. Next month will be the review of the preliminary and final plats.

Commissioner Freidenberger asked about traffic flow. Mr. Larsen explained that there is limited connectivity. The pointed out the road to the north, Oak Street (730 North), and the two roads to the south (200 and 300 West) which run the length of the development. Oak Street ends on the west end due to the railroad tracks. Commissioner Higginbotham pointed out that there is a farm road to the north of the property. Chairman Gibbons advised that this road is outside of the City limit and is not owned by this development.

Mr. Larsen pointed out, at the request of Commissioner Heaps, and as indicated on the notes of the plat, that there will be 193 single-family units (41.15%), 276 multi-family units for a total of 469 units, and 19.34 acres (29.6%) of open space. Mr. Boudrero said this meets the density bonus calculations.

Chairman Gibbons noted that this project has gone through STRC twice.

Mr. Larsen said the goal is to get the clubhouse in as soon as possible. The sewer connection is in the southwest portion of the property. The first phase of homes will begin from southwest to northwest (pointed out on the plat) and over to the northeast where the clubhouse will be. The two accesses will be Oak Street and 300 West. The duplexes have been removed and replaced with townhomes.

Commissioner Freidenberger asked about amenities. Mr. Larsen said there will be a clubhouse, with a fitness room, pool/jacuzzi, outside grilling areas, outdoor sports court, playground, and a pavilion with picnic tables. There will also be a 10' trail that connects to the 5' sidewalks to make the area more walkable. There has been some discussion about possibly adding an area for disc golf and/or a small soccer field. He also pointed out the setbacks around the power lines.

Mr. Larsen confirmed that the multi-family parking is 2.5 stalls per unit. Visitor parking around the clubhouse is separate. There should be plenty of parking available.

Commissioner Freidenberger asked about a trail or space behind the existing homes. Mr. Larsen has met with the adjacent neighborhood, the development has been designed to put in larger lots, which are comparable to the existing lots. There will be a fence put in, but they cannot put in a trail in the backyard of existing homes. He also confirmed that the sewer will be a traditional gravity flow system (not a lift station).

Commissioner Higginbotham asked about the size of the roads and the 4 acres of undeveloped land. Mr. Larsen said the roads are standard size, except for 200 West, which is larger. The undeveloped area is located under the high-voltage power lines so at this time there is no plan to do anything with it at this time. The hope is to be able to purchase property to the north in the future, which is why there are three possible access points at the north end of the development.

Commissioner Freidenberger is pleased that this exceeds the open space minimum. Commissioner Bell complimented the extra parking. Mr. Larsen said there is a similar-style project being finished up in Hyrum and invited the Commission to visit it.

Commissioner Freidenberger asked why this particular design was chosen, rather than stacked vertical units. Mr. Larsen said stacking can have more litigation. This format allows a homeowner to own the ground beneath the unit. He prefers this style of product.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Weber to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** Ordinance 21-25, an Ordinance rezoning Cache County Parcel Numbers 08-043-0022, 08-043-0021, 08- 043-0025, 08-043-0031, 08-043-0013, 08-043-0012, 08-043-0010, 08-043-0011, 08-043- 0007, 08-043-0006, 08-043-0002, 08-043-0003, 08-043-0016, 08-043-0013 and 08-043-0014 from A-10 (Agricultural 10-Acre) and R-1-10 (Single Family Residential 10,000 Square Feet) to MPC (Master Planned Community). The parcels total approximately 89.79 acres and are located at approximately 100 West to 300 West from 450 North to 800 North. Commissioner Freidenberger seconded the motion. Motion approved (7-0).

Vote:

Aye: Bell, Freidenberger, Gibbons, Heaps, Holbrook, Reis, Weber

Public Hearing, no sooner than 7:00 P.M., for the purpose of discussing Ordinance 21-28, an Ordinance amending the Smithfield City Municipal Code Title 17 “Zoning Regulations”, by amending Chapter 17.68 “CC Community Commercial Zone”, Section 17.68.060 “Special Provisions”, Chapter 17.64 “CB Central Business District Zone”, Section 17.64.060 “Special Provisions”, Chapter 17.120 “Use Matrix Table”,

7:15 p.m. Public Hearing Opened

7:16 p.m. Public Hearing Closed

Discussion and possible vote on Ordinance 21-28

Ordinance 21-28 proposes to make changes to multiple chapters of code. In 17.84 “Intrablock Developments” the proposal is to add a reference to the code that delineates the specified part of the city where intrablock developments are allowed (16.04.030). The recommendation also includes removing any residential units from all of the commercial zones, not just the “General Commercial” zone. Residential units would be removed from both 17.68 (Community Commercial) and 17.64 (Central Business District) and the corresponding locations in 17.12.010, “Use Allowance Matrix.”

Mr. Bodily explained that a Mixed-Use Zone is better for allowing a mix of commercial and residential uses, rather than allowing residential use (by a conditional use permit) in a commercial area. Chairman Gibbons noted that this ordinance does not limit the option but serves to better organize the use within one zone. Mr. Boudrero said this will also help clean up parking and outdoor storage areas. Councilmember Wells also noted that Mixed-Use has limited areas where it can be located.

Commissioner Higginbotham said the workplace is changing, if the trend continues and more people can work from home, he questioned whether there should be a limit to certain areas. Chairman Gibbons thinks this should be good for the near future, however, it could be changed over time if the demand increases. Councilmember Wells said it can be reviewed to anticipate where individuals might want to use it and then make sure the parameters are appropriate; one of the main reasons for this change is to eliminate the ability to put residential units in a commercial-based zone. Mr. Bodily also pointed out that this does not change the ability to have a home-based business.

MOTION: Motion made by Commissioner Heaps to forward a recommendation to the City Council to **approve** Ordinance 21-28, an Ordinance amending the Smithfield City Municipal Code Title 17 “Zoning Regulations”, by amending Chapter 17.68 “CC Community Commercial Zone”, Section 17.68.060 “Special Provisions”, Chapter 17.64 “CB Central Business District Zone”, Section 17.64.060 “Special Provisions”, Chapter 17.120 “Use Matrix Table”. Commissioner Freidenberger seconded the motion. Motion approved (7-0).

Vote:

Aye: Bell, Freidenberger, Gibbons, Heaps, Holbrook, Reis, Weber

Discussion and review of building height requirements and setback requirements in the Municipal Code.

Height:

Mr. Bodily confirmed for Commissioner Holbrook that a 3-story building would be about 45-50' in height. Councilmember Wells explained that height is measured from ground level to the peak of the roof.

Commissioner Weber asked about airport restrictions. Mr. Bodily said most of the City is in the airport overlay zone so anything above 35' would have to be reported to the airport. Commissioner Weber asked about other structures such as barns or silos. Councilmember Wells advised that silos are an exception. Commissioner Weber said this seems like a natural progression to go higher in specific areas.

Chairman Gibbons suggested considering some areas where it may not make sense to increase the height, such as in residential areas. Commissioner Weber said one reason why Logan City may have higher structures is the fact that they are landlocked. Allowing additional height can be a tool to help prevent sprawl. The Commission felt comfortable with a 3-4-story building height in appropriate locations. Councilmember Wells pointed out that much higher than that can require an elevator and become quite expensive; 3 stories seems reasonable. The Commission seemed to be generally comfortable allowing 3 stories (45-50' height) in the RM, MF, MPC, GC, CC, CBD, MU, and Gateway zones.

Setbacks:

Chairman Gibbons suggested considering a separate setback for a residential home or building and a garage (e.g. allowing a reduced front building setback while requiring a longer driveway setback to accommodate vehicles and prevent them from blocking sidewalks).

Councilmember Wells answered for Commissioner Freidenberger that setbacks are measured from the property line, which does not include the park strip or sidewalk.

Commissioner Freidenberger asked if reducing a setback would work with smaller lots; Councilmember Wells said smaller lots in PUDs have different setbacks, however design-wise it might be possible in certain situations.

Commissioner Weber thinks this idea will help provide homeowners and developers have more flexible alternatives.

Commissioner Higginbotham said this is not only about single-family residential, he has concerns about PUDs as well. He is more inclined to have one set of setbacks but require a 25' driveway throughout. Commissioner Weber questioned whether that would solve the problem. Commissioner Higginbotham said it would certainly help by allowing space for two vehicles to park on the driveway.

Commissioner Holbrook advised, that as a builder, this idea makes sense. Allowing a reduced front setback would allow options to have a larger backyard. He thinks a 20' front setback is reasonable. This could also help with water bills and maintenance. Commissioner Freidenberger suggested 15' because of the park strip and sidewalk. Councilmember Wells said the Council may not be amenable to 15'. Commissioner Bell asked what the Council thinks about the PUD setbacks. Councilmember Wells said those setbacks were put in place before most of the member's appointments.

Commissioner Higginbotham pointed out that North Logan has a 20' front setback.

There was some discussion about the difference in corner setbacks.

Chairman Gibbons asked staff to do some research about other communities that may have dual setback requirements. There will more discussion at the next meeting.

OTHER

Mr. Bodily said 1000 South is on a temporary hold while waiting for the gas company. The bridge crossing (by Smithfield Implement) is still scheduled for next spring. Most of the overlays are done, the striping will not be done before school begins.

MEETING ADJOURNED at 8:05 p.m.

Minutes submitted by Debbie Zilles

Scott Gibbons, Chairman